

The Hymn

JULY 1954



The President's Message

"HOPE OF THE WORLD"

A Committee of The Hymn Society has completed its work on the Evanston hymns. Out of nearly five hundred new texts submitted, eleven were selected for publication, and have been offered for use at the Evanston Assembly of the World Council of Churches. These new hymns were solicited from the English-speaking world; three of the eleven were written by members of churches outside the United States. One is by John Shirley Anderson of Australia, another by Thomas Tiplady of England, and a third by Walter John Dean, a minister of the United Church of Canada. It is noteworthy that Sarah E. Taylor, whose hymn was chosen for the Bible celebrations of 1952, has written one of the Evanston hymns and also one of the recent new city hymns.

The first choice among the Evanston hymns was that by Georgia Harkness, one of our outstanding American religious leaders who has long been closely associated with the ecumenical movement. It is entitled "The Hope of the World," and the five stanzas are as follows:

Hope of the world, Thou Christ of great compassion,

Speak to our fearful hearts by conflict rent.

Save us, Thy people, from consuming passion,

Who by our own false hopes and aims are spent.

Hope of the world, God's gift from highest heaven,

Bringing to hungry souls the bread of life,

Still let Thy spirit unto us be given

To heal earth's wounds and end her bitter strife.

Hope of the world, afoot on dusty highways,

Showing to wandering souls the path of light;

Walk Thou beside us lest the tempting byways

Lure us away from Thee to endless night.

Hope of the world, Who by Thy cross didst save us

From death and dark despair, from sin and guilt;

We render back the love Thy mercy gave us;

Take Thou our lives and use them as Thou wilt.

Hope of the world, O Christ, o'er death victorious,

Who by this sign didst conquer grief and pain,

We would be faithful to Thy gospel glorious:

Thou art our Lord! Thou dost forever reign!

—*Words copyright, 1954, by The Hymn Society of America*

(Continued on p. 81)

The Hymn

Published by The Hymn Society of America, New York

Volume 5	July, 1954	Number 3
THE PRESIDENT'S MESSAGE		70
THE EDITOR'S COLUMN		72
AMERICAN ASSOCIATIONS OF JAMES MONTGOMERY <i>Arthur S. Holbrook</i>		73
A HYMN PROJECT AND HOW IT GREW <i>J. William Jones</i>		79
HYMN: "O GOD WHO MAD'ST THE LIGHT THAT DAILY FLOWS"		82
HYMN TUNE: FARNELL		83
PAUL GERHARDT (1607-1676) POET OF CONSOLATION <i>John H. Johansen</i>		84
THE CLOSING HYMN <i>H. Myron Braun</i>		90
HYMNS IN PERIODICAL LITERATURE <i>Ruth Ellis Messenger</i>		94
REVIEWS		99

Rev. George Litch Knight, *Editor* Dr. Ruth Ellis Messenger, *Associate Editor*

Contributing Editors

Mr. Parke S. Barnard	Dr. Austin Lovelace	Dr. Leonard Ellinwood
Dr. A. W. Binder	Mr. Irving Lowens	Mr. J. Vincent Higginson
Canon George W. Briggs	Dr. Morgan Phelps Noyes	Rev. Lester Hostetler
Mr. Ralph Brigham	Dr. Robert L. Stevenson	Mr. Edward Johe

The Hymn is a quarterly published in January, April, July and October by The Hymn Society of America, Inc.

Membership in The Hymn Society of America, including the *Papers* of the Society and copies of *The Hymn*, \$3.00 yearly (accredited student members, \$1.50).

All correspondence concerning membership, literature of the society, or change of address should be directed to The Hymn Society of America, 297 Fourth Avenue, New York 10, New York. Telephone: Gramercy 7-7663.

Editor's address: Rev. George Litch Knight, West Side Presbyterian Church, Ridgewood, New Jersey. Telephone: OLiver 2-1967.

Material appearing in *The Hymn* may not be reproduced without written permission from the Editor.

Printed in The United States of America.

The Editor's Column

MAKING THE HYMN IMPORTANT

The April 16, 1954, issue of *Colliers' Magazine* carried a beautifully illustrated article entitled "Favorite Hymns, An Easter album of ten religious songs Protestants like best." In the introductory paragraphs the following lines appear:

Not long ago the editors of the Christian Herald, an inter-denominational magazine devoted to evangelical Christianity, wondered whether hymn singing is as joyful and popular today as it was years ago. And they wanted to know what hymns people were singing. A poll of the magazine's readers revealed that the preference of modern churchgoers was for spirited gospel songs, rather than for the dignified hymns preferred by hymnologists. Of the more than 600 hymns named by readers first choice was The Old Rugged Cross, with catchy words and melody. It appeared on 24 per cent of the ballots. Most of the standard, slow hymns, such as Holy, Holy, Holy, polled only a few votes.

Other hymns listed were: "Nearer my God to Thee," "What a Friend we have in Jesus," "Abide with Me," "Rock of Ages," "Jesus, Lover of my soul," "He leadeth me," "I love to tell the story," and the following gospel songs: "In the garden" and "Sweet hour of prayer."

The Editors of *Colliers* made a familiar mistake: classing hymns and gospel songs together and calling them hymns. (It is interesting to note that the sub-title does refer to "religious songs.") Perhaps the ministers and musicians of Protestantism have failed to make this distinction clearly. The Editor of this periodical does not object to the use of gospel songs within certain limits as long as they are not called hymns nor used to substitute for legitimate hymns in a service of worship. But it is depressing to think that the last three decades have not seen a greater love for the truly great hymns — old and new — of our traditions. Fosdick's "God of grace" and Merrill's "Rise up, O men of God" ought to have become well known by American congregations by now. And how sad that "All hail the power" or "Jesus shall reign" were not included among the hymns listed as favorites.

The Editor takes an extremely dim view of polls of the sort conducted by *The Christian Herald*. It is scarcely plausible to believe that their readers would represent a *complete* cross-section of Protestantism in America. An expression of opinion on this matter and on hymn polls in general would be of interest both to the Editor and to the Executive Committee of The Hymn Society.

(Continued on p. 78)

American Associations of James Montgomery The Hymn Writer

ARTHUR S. HOLBROOK

INTEREST IN THE LIFE and work of James Montgomery is quickened by the remembrance that the centenary of his death falls this year. In the city where he lived for sixty-two of his eighty-two years of life, celebrations are taking place and one of the most important and noteworthy is the Conference of The Hymn Society of Great Britain and Ireland, July 13th-15th. It is fitting that The Hymn Society pays its tribute in the place Montgomery adopted for the scene of his life's work seeing that through the labors of James Montgomery, Thomas Cotterill, William Mercer and John Julian, Sheffield has played so decisive a part in the story of hymnody.

James Montgomery was more than a writer of hymns: he was perhaps the greatest publicly acclaimed person the "city of steel" has known. It acknowledged this in many ways before it gave him his public funeral on May 11th, 1854, and erected a worthy monument over his grave at public expense later. For the majority of his long years in Sheffield there was no great public occasion but what it was expected that he would be present and give a lead. All that concerned the spiritual and moral well-being of the people claimed his service. He was a founder of the Societies that promoted Sunday Schools, the Bible, Overseas Missions, Public Health, Education, Savings, and he was one of the leaders that gave Sheffield a public gas service and an efficient police force. He never failed the place and the people of his adoption. Yet, during those years in which he was such a zealous servant of the community, he earned for himself the title, *The Christian Poet*. By that title he was known in America as well as in England and a close study of his life and work bears out the description fully.

In his day he ranked as a major poet to whom many American writers as well as Byron, Southey, Scott, Wordsworth, Moore and Howitt paid great deference. When the Poet Laureate, Southey, died, many expected Montgomery to take his place and wear the nation's laurel wreath. And yet his own prophecy about the works of his pen has come true. Once asked by a Whitby solicitor which of his works would live, he replied, "None, Sir; nothing, except perhaps a few of my hymns." In the preface to his *Christian Psalmist* he wrote: "I would rather be the anonymous author of a few hymns than the author of a dozen novels."

THE HYMN

mous author of a few hymns which should thus become an imperishable inheritance to the people of God, than bequeath another epic poem to the world which would rank my name with Homer, Virgil, and our "greater Milton." None can say whether his hymns will become an imperishable inheritance to the people of God, but a century after his death, in America as in England, he probably takes third place to Wesley and Watts as one of the greatest hymn writers in English.

The poetic fires began to burn in Montgomery through the writing of hymns as a boy at Fulneck Moravian Seminary, Yorkshire, and turning to the old Moravian hymns for his models. Where he began, there he ended: his last work was the hymn he composed on April 29th, 1854, the day before he died. There were days at school, however, when he yearned to be something of a Homer. Before his fourteenth year he composed a mock heroic poem of over a thousand lines in imitation of Homer's "Frogs and Mice." And in his original intention of writing "The World before the Flood," most of which he wrote before he was twenty, there appears to be some attempt to outbid Milton. The first collection he ever saw, as a boy at school, was William Cowper's and, at that early age, he thought he could write better verses himself. Before he was ten years old he had filled an exercise book with hymns composed from models out of the Moravian hymn book. One hymn, which the Moravians would take with them to America as they sailed with three dollars in their pockets in the 1730's, had a verse of which Montgomery said he did not remember the time when he did not know it. Through all his life its haunting power persuaded him. At twelve years of age he wrote a hymn of five stanzas on this verse:

[- - - Thou]

For me in torment agonizing
To a garden didst retire,
There I hear the prayers from Thy heart rising
My salvation to acquire.
For me shudderest Thou in that dire passion,
Thou hast labored for my salvation;
Pale and red by turns I see
Thy face whilst Thou prayst for me.

As youth and man Montgomery's eyes must often have turned westwards where his Moravian forbears had gone and

where his parents followed, as missionaries to the West Indies, before he reached his thirteenth year. By the time he was twenty both had died there. To America his employer, Joseph Gales, sailed two years after the young poet had become his clerk on the *Sheffield Register*, the radical newspaper Gales first published seven years earlier, in 1787. An article of Gales was judged to be seditious by the government and a warrant was issued. To avoid arrest Gales fled to America and, in the years following, he made many appeals to his former colleague to join him, but the young poet resisted each request. When Montgomery wrote his great poem against the slave trade, "The West Indies," and his "Songs of Liberation" and, in all the active support he gave to Clarkson and Wilberforce, though his body and pen were in England, his mind must often have been in the western world.

Many other contacts with America opened up as Montgomery's poetry was published and made its way there. The sentiments of *The Christian Poet* were welcomed in a country that set great store upon freedom of speech and freedom of worship. His poems had a ready sale and, as a result, many Americans made their way to the poet's home. It was almost a pilgrimage of grace to the rather squalid house and shop in Hartshead, Sheffield, but many visitors from America were anxious to make it. And when the poet moved to his more stately home at The Mount, away from the bustle and business of the town, he was still the magnet that drew Americans to Sheffield. As a young man, Emerson read "The Wanderer of Switzerland" soon after it was published. He admired it intensely and cherished the desire to meet its author face to face. That opportunity came in January, 1848, and The Mount entertained no more welcome guest than he. This work gained such favor all over America that it ran into twenty editions as against nine in England. William Cullen Bryant was an ardent admirer of "The World Before the Flood," which was even more popular with Americans; and, for Montgomery's sake, he visited Sheffield. Such was the esteem in which the poet was held that when three Americans called to see the aging writer, at the Mount, they introduced themselves with the words, "You were known, Sir, in America, and loved, before we were born." Their description of the man they saw is graphic and worthy of record. James Montgomery was "small and thin, slightly stooping, having a bright eye and a sharp face." Mrs. Sigourney, then regarded in England as the Mrs. Hemans of America,

THE HYMN

related her experience of visiting *The Christian Poet*, in her book, "Pleasant Memories of Pleasant Lands,"

And sure high praise
Is due to him who steadily devotes
His heaven-given talents to their highest end,
And ne'er disjoins them from their Maker's praise.
Such meed is thine, Montgomery, meek in heart,
And full of Christian love. We said farewell
Reluctantly to those, who like tried friends,
Though newly seen, had marked each fleeting hour
With deeds of kindness.

One other association is interesting to recall. When the poet was eighty his friends made great birthday celebrations which attracted a good deal of attention far outside England. In America, however, they were misinterpreted and thought to be a memorial of his death. Consequently an account of the poet's death, along with a sketch of his life and character, was published in the leading newspapers. A copy of this fell into the hands of Montgomery and he thoroughly enjoyed reading his American obituary. The disturbing sequel to this mistake was that Miss Sarah Gales, who had kept house for the poet for over fifty years, received letters of condolence from her relatives in America, and this distressed her considerably, and in consequence, Montgomery also.

Concerning the hymns by which the poet is known in America, in England, and to the English-speaking world, it is not quite true to say, as Julian's *Dictionary of Hymnology* has it, that more than one hundred of his hymns are in common use. What high claim that would be today: over twenty-five per cent of an author's hymns in common use! Even so the number still used is high, particularly so, seeing that this writer always lacked the official support of one of the larger denominations of the Christian Church, such as the Wesleys and Watts have had for two centuries. Although James Montgomery owed his spiritual rebirth to Methodism, as he himself acknowledged, and though the closing years of his life were spent in intimate fellowship with the Anglican Church, his membership was with the Moravian Church at Fulneck. But he who a century ago was truly called "the poet laureate of all the Churches," composed hymns which are in general demand by all sections of Protestant Christendom today.

Speaking for America, A. E. Bailey, in *The Gospel in Hymns*,

indicates, that this author wrote more hymns in common use today (12) than any writer except Charles Wesley (20) and Isaac Watts. Of the twelve he cites six that come within the scope of his work, which is to show what hymns are offered to tens of millions of English-speaking Christians. The following ten hymn books are examined as to their contents.

- A. Anglican (Canada) *The Hymn Book* 1938
- B. Baptist-Disciples *Christian Worship* 1941
- C. Congregational *Pilgrim Hymnal* 1935
- E. Episcopal (U.S.) *The Hymnal* 1940
- L. United Lutheran *Common Service Book* 1918
- M. Methodist *The Methodist Hymnal* 1938
- N. Undenominational *New Church Hymnal* 1937
- P. Presbyterian *The Hymnal* 1937
- S. Anglican (English) *Songs of Praise* 1931
- U. United Church of Canada *The Hymnary* 1930

The following six Montgomery hymns are to be found in some or all of the above books: "Hail to the Lord's Anointed," "Angels from the realms of glory," "O Spirit of the Living God," "In the hour of trial," "Prayer is the soul's sincere desire," "Go to dark Gethsemane." The first two hymns are in all ten books; the next two are in eight; and the last are in six.

Although the main intention of this article is to deal with the American associations of James Montgomery, it may be of interest to indicate the usage of his hymns in Great Britain and Ireland. The one may provide a backcloth for the other. For this it will be best to refer to hymn books that are widely circulated and therefore indicate common usage. The following eleven books serve the larger Protestant denominations in Church or School worship. The figures in brackets give the number of Montgomery hymns in each book.

- | | | |
|---|------|------|
| 1. <i>Hymns Ancient and Modern</i> | 1950 | (11) |
| 2. <i>Hymns Ancient and Modern</i> | 1924 | (13) |
| 3. <i>The English Hymnal</i> | 1933 | (10) |
| 4. <i>Songs of Praise</i> | 1931 | (8) |
| 5. <i>Public School Hymnal</i> | 1949 | (12) |
| 6. <i>The Methodist Hymnbook</i> | 1933 | (14) |
| 7. <i>The Church Hymnary (Revised)</i> | 1930 | (15) |
| 8. <i>Congregational Praise</i> | 1950 | (22) |
| 9. <i>Congregational Hymnary</i> | 1916 | (20) |
| 10. <i>The Baptist Church Hymnal (Rev.)</i> | 1933 | (15) |
| 11. <i>The B. B. C. Hymnal</i> | 1931 | (11) |

THE HYMN

Hymns Ancient and Modern (1924) and *Congregational Hymnary* (1916) are included because hymn books (1) and (8) have not yet had time to replace them and they are still widely used. Of the six hymns above cited from Bailey, "Hail to the Lord's Anointed" is found in all the English books; "Angels from the realms of glory," is in ten; "O Spirit of the living God" is in six; "In the hour of trial" is in four; "Prayer is the soul's sincere desire" is in seven; "Go to dark Gethsemane" is in seven. Seeing that James Montgomery helped to produce an improved Moravian hymn book, and that he edited the 1826 edition, it may be well to note that in the British Moravian Liturgy and Hymns (1914), in present use, he has thirty-nine original hymns and one translation. But the book, which has the largest quota, still used by a small number of congregations, is *The Primitive Methodist Hymnal* (1912). Here, Montgomery's hymns number forty-five out of 1347 hymns.

In conclusion, a Montgomery hymn once widely sung in America but which generally appears to be forgotten now, "Be joyful in God, all ye lands of the earth," serves as a reminder of the changes constantly taking place in the usage of hymns. Should other hymns completely take the place of those by the Sheffield Psalmist, may they more worthily invite to the praise of God and constrain the singers more readily to adore the Lamb.

EDITOR'S COLUMN: *Continued from p. 72.* ---

That there are churches aplenty across America in which hymn singing has its rightful place and in which there is a healthy use of good material is encouraging. The weekly bulletins and choir newsletters from First Methodist Church in Boise, Idaho, give evidence of a dynamic musical program in which over 300 persons in various choirs learn good hymns. How gratifying to see a great choral program which includes songs by the Cherub Choir to the "St. Matthew Passion," and in which hymns have their rightful place. Hubert Vance Taylor, in the south, has wrought heroically in an effort to raise the standards of church and seminary appreciation of hymnody.

It is to be hoped that our seminaries and schools of sacred music will stress the importance of the hymn—musically, spiritually, and from the standpoint of congregational participation. In this way the coming generation will come to realize the importance of hymns and the value of our enduring heritage.

A Hymn Project And How It Grew

J. WILLIAM JONES

THE STORY BEHIND the current Columbia Masterworks record release, *Hymns and Anthems* ML 4866 by the University of Redlands Choir, dates back to 1952 and a project concerning hymns in connection with our annual campus-wide Religious Emphasis Week.

Of course as a church-related institution, religion is emphasized at Redlands every week, including a compulsory Thursday morning service of worship with sermon. Once a year, however, a week is set aside for special observance. This includes, among other things affecting the entire student body and faculty, a guest preacher for the week and daily morning services of worship. The entire project is undertaken and guided by the Religious Activities Council of the student body in consultation with the University pastor, the Reverend Clarence Downing.

The music for Religious Emphasis Week is an important item in the University Choir's general activity. Normally numbering around the hundred mark, and representing approximately one tenth of the student body, the choir is organized for the specific purpose of providing choral music for our weekly service of worship. As such, during the past six years, I have opened it to members of the student body regardless of advanced vocal ability or musicianship. In no way does it conform to the so-called *a capella* choir system prevalent on many college campuses. We do not tour, for instance, although periodically we go off campus for an evening to sing in some church in a near-by city here in the California Southland.

Each year the choir and church music students undertake a particular project in relation to music and worship for Religious Emphasis Week. The 1952 project, from which our recording happened to result, centered around hymns and anthems and organ music based on hymn tunes. It represented carefully integrated planning and effort on the part of the choir, organ students, conducting students, members of other courses within our church music curriculum, the Christian Activities Council and even the guest preacher for the week.

Specifically, a hymn was chosen for each day's service. Two choral preludes based on the tune were chosen for the opening and concluding voluntaries and an anthem based on the tune was selected for the choir. In building the service for the day, the

THE HYMN

central theme of the text was incorporated in the service detail and the sermon also reflected it.

The integrated preparation of all the music by the church music students involved was one of the most interesting and worthwhile aspects of the project. As members of the choir, they prepared the anthems based on hymn tunes. As conducting students, they learned to conduct them and each student prepared the anthems with a small, balanced section of the choir. As organ students, in cooperation with my two distinguished colleagues who teach organ at Redlands, Leslie P. Spelman (also Director of the School of Music) and Margaret Whitney Dow, they prepared the anthem accompaniments and the choral preludes. As members of the hymnology class, they studied the historical background of the hymns and helped to prepare data concerning them for the program notes in the printed service sheet for the week. As members of the class in service planning, they assisted in the preparation of unified services around the central theme for the day.

When the week was concluded, we decided to preserve the hymns and anthems on tape recording, using the splendid equipment and "know-how" of Mr. Kenneth Folsom, a local business man who is interested in recording as a hobby. The recordings made in the resonant interior of Memorial Chapel with the four manual Casavant organ turned out so well that shortly afterwards we recorded quite a number of additional anthems in our repertoire of the moment.

After hearing them, our University president, Dr. George Armacost, suggested the possibility of interesting one of the major record companies in issuing an album and asked me to consider a trip to New York for that purpose. About that time an old and valued friend, Helen Hosmer of the Crane Institute at Potsdam, New York, who certainly can be listed as one of this country's most distinguished choral conductors, happened to visit us at Redlands. She heard the choir, listened carefully to the recordings and advised me to undertake the New York trip.

The day after my arrival I played the recordings for three of the major record companies. All three were interested. Two made a definite offer. We signed with Columbia and arranged for two albums, the current one of hymns and anthems and a second for release next fall containing Christmas carols and anthems from our fifth annual Redlands Christmas Festival, "The

Feast of Lights." The festival now draws people to our campus from all parts of California and from surrounding states as well, necessitating three consecutive presentations in our huge Chapel for which the choir offers a pretentious program of music each year.

For both the current and future album of records, organ accompaniments were played by one of our most brilliant church music students, Charles Davis Smith, a native of Phoenix, Arizona.

One further aspect of this whole affair has particularly interested me. I mentioned earlier that several general anthems in addition to the original set of hymns and anthems based on hymn tunes were included on the tape taken to New York and eventually deposited with Columbia. In selecting the material to be included on our first record release, Mr. David Oppenheim (through whose personal interest and attention our records have been issued) selected from the whole collection at hand, all the hymns and all the anthems based on hymn tunes, adding only two other general anthems to fill out the record space. In writing me about them, he said, "I think they are very, very, beautiful." Of course it pleased us here at Redlands that of the two anthems added one was composed by a member of the choir, James Todd. It has since been accepted for publication by C. C. Birchard and Company of Boston. For the most part the anthems on the record are simple, the latter (with the possible exception of the "Magnificat in B Minor" by T. Tertius Noble,) are well within the capabilities of the average small choir. I believe they demonstrate that good music need not necessarily be complex music; that simple anthems with careful preparation and presentation can be beautiful and inspiring.

THE PRESIDENT'S MESSAGE: *Continued from p. 70*

A folder containing Dr. Harkness' hymn set to two tunes, DONNE SECOURS and ANCIENT OF DAYS, together with translations in French and German, is available from the Hymn Society at 3c each in any quantity. A pamphlet with both words and music of the eleven hymns may be obtained from the Society at 25c each for ten or more, 15c each for fifty or more.

—DEANE EDWARDS

“O God Who Mad’st The Light That Daily Flows”

MISSIONARY HYMN

Ivo MACNAUGHTON CLARK

O God Who mad’st the light that daily flows
From east to west suffusing land and sea,
Bestow the inward light of life on those
Who live in death’s dark night continually.

O Thou, whose eyes are as a flame of fire,
Piercing the heart, dividing false from true,
Purge from the minds of men all base desire,
And in Thy pity give them life anew,

That in the lands which Thou hast made so fair
No more may war and dreadful terrors rage;
In unity let juster laws declare
Thy holy will, and speed the happier age.

O when shall come that new and better world,
That dream of man since first he lost his way?
When 'gainst the darkness with Christ's flag unfurled
The Church of God goes forth to win the day!

Ivo Macnaughton Clark, 1883-1950, was minister of the Church of Scotland in the parish of Farnell for many years. This hymn, written in 1947 for the 150th Anniversary of the Church Missionary Society, has been set to music by Kenneth G. Finlay, the distinguished English hymn tune composer, a lifelong friend of the author. The words and music, here published for the first time, are printed by permission of Mrs. Ivo M. Clark and Kenneth G. Finlay.

FARNELL 10,10,10,10.
(d = about 44) Kenneth G. Finlay

The musical score consists of four staves of music in common time, key signature of one sharp, and dynamic level d. The lyrics are written below each staff.

Staff 1: O God who mad-est light that dai-ly flows

Staff 2: From east to west suf-fus-ing land and sea,

Staff 3: Be-stow the in-ward light of life on those

Staff 4: Who live in death's dark night con-fin- ual- ly.

Paul Gerhardt (1607-1676)

Poet of Consolation

JOHN H. JOHANSEN

A MONG THE HYMNS from German sources to be found in the various hymn books of the Protestant churches there are a number from the pen of Paul Gerhardt, who has been called "the typical poet of the Lutheran Church, as George Herbert is of the English."¹ Gerhardt, who ranks, next to Luther as the most gifted and popular hymn-writer of the Lutheran Church, was the author of one hundred and thirty hymns, all of conspicuous merit. Yet as one examines the various hymn collections in use in the churches today, as compared with earlier editions, one finds that fewer of Gerhardt's hymns are in use now than was formerly the case. Why have the newer hymnals neglected Gerhardt? Has he been forgotten?

It should be pointed out that the names of Martin Luther, Paul Gerhardt, and Johann Sebastian Bach shine like three brilliant constellations in the firmament of Lutheran history during the first two and one-half centuries. These names form a triad of spiritual kinship and greatness in their respective realms. Gerhardt's hymns are as abiding as the music of Bach and as imperishable as the Evangelical truth set forth by Luther.

The outward circumstances of Gerhardt's life were for the most part gloomy. The son of the mayor of Graefenhainichen, he was born in that Saxon town a few miles from Wittenberg on March 12, 1607. Educated at the University of Wittenberg, his earlier years were spent amid the horrors of the Thirty Years' War. How much of interruption, disappointment, and frustration there was in his life may be judged from the fact that Gerhardt did not attain to a settled position until he was forty-four years of age. He was then a private tutor, and a candidate for holy orders. At the close of 1651 he was ordained, and became minister of a country church at Mittenwalde. It was four years later that he married Anna Maria Barthold, daughter of a chancery advocate in Berlin, in whose home he had been a tutor. His wife, after a long illness, died in March, 1668, while of the five children of the marriage only one, a son, Paul Frederick, passed the period of childhood.

In 1657 Gerhardt was called to the church of St. Nicholas in Berlin, and the sunniest period of his life was during the early years of this ministry, when he enjoyed universal love and es-

team. When the great Elector of Brandenburg required that all the clergy should pledge themselves by a declaration to follow his edicts of 1662 and 1664, limiting freedom of speech on certain questions which divided the Lutheran and Reformed Churches, Gerhardt refused to sign the declaration and was dismissed from office.

So far as the content of the declaration was concerned, Gerhardt could have signed it without hesitation. His was not a disputatious nature and he had never used antagonistic expressions in his sermons, at which the declaration was especially aimed. As one writer has said:

The reason for his refusal clearly lay in the fact that he regarded the declaration as an infringement upon his Lutheran convictions, his scrupulous conscience making him feel that all yielding in matters relating to the doctrines of the Reformation was wrong.²

Gerhardt's latter years at Luebben, where he served as Pastor from 1669 till his death in 1676, were passed among a rough and unsympathetic people. Miss Winkworth describes them thus: "Here he spent the last seven years of his life; but they were years of sadness, for his wife was gone, his only child had more than one dangerous illness, and he was living in a land of strangers."³ The inscription on his portrait at Luebben not unjustly describes him as *Theologus in cribo Satanae versatus*, "a divine strained in the sieve of Satan."

For a long time Gerhardt was forgotten. To be sure, he did not reach out for universal recognition by means of his hymns. Gerhardt was preeminently a Pastor and did nothing to publicize his hymns. They originated partly as occasional poems. They were copied by hand or formed an appendix to funeral sermons and spiritual addresses. Not until 1648 did the choicest of his hymns appear in the hymn books in Berlin through the solicitation of his friends and especially through the efforts of the cantor Johann Crueger. Later, the first edition of the one hundred and thirty hymns appeared in 1666 and 1667. This likewise was the result of the tireless activity of Johann Georg Ebeling, successor to Crueger and devoted friend of Gerhardt.

Nevertheless, the popularity of the hymns was not very far-reaching at the time, nor did it last more than a decade. In a larger measure Gerhardt's hymns shared the same fate that befell Bach's music. During more than one hundred years, from 1708 to

1817, not one new edition of the hymns appeared. Finally, in 1817 one Tiedemann, mayor of Bremen, issued a selection of Gerhardt's hymns in the hope that their use might aid the religious spirit of his time. From then on study led to the re-discovery of the treasury of hymns by Gerhardt. At least 84 of his hymns have one or more English versions, having been naturalized in English by John Wesley, James W. Alexander, Catherine Winkworth, A. T. Russell, John Kelly, and others. Catherine Winkworth translated 20 of his hymns into English, and, as Haeussler⁴ has pointed out, "she caught the spirit of Gerhardt's hymns better than any other English versifier, reproducing even many of the alliterations of which he was so fond." Instances could be multiplied to show the effect of Gerhardt's hymns on men in various positions and stations, in different situations, in private life, in public life, in times of war, and in seasons of distress and strain.

Quite naturally the question arises as to the reason for the tremendous appeal of Gerhardt's hymns. The question might be disposed of by saying that Gerhardt represents a period when hymn writing passed from the objective to the subjective. This is, of course, true. Gerhardt's hymns marked the transition from confessional and ecclesiastical hymns to hymns of a pietistic and devotional nature. Sixteen of Gerhardt's hymns begin with "Ich" ("I"), and of the rest more than sixty concern only his own heart and God. His hymns reflect personal experiences in a manner which gave new encouragement to his friends and family.

But somewhat more must be said. Gerhardt's hymns have a popular appeal because he understood the people; not because he put the teachings of Christian truth into verse but because he had absorbed the Gospel into his own innermost being and then reproduced it in poetic form in the language of the people as his own experience and his own possession. He is subjective only in the sense that his hymns are a personal confession of a universal faith. As Jefferson says:

Well may it be that the source of the power of
Gerhardt's hymns lay in the man himself. Just as there
is no great sermon without the soul of the preacher in
it, so there is no truly great hymn without something
of the soul of the writer given to it and through it.
Gerhardt knew victory in struggle; peace in conflict;
hope in darkness, and a triumphant love.⁵

Perhaps this is best seen in one of the most notable of Ger-

hardt's hymns translated by John Wesley as "Commit thou all thy griefs." In English hymnals it is given now in various, and often abbreviated forms, owing to the length of the original, which was fifteen stanzas of four lines each. But it can be claimed without hesitation that it is one of the greatest hymns in any language. The following version is found in the "Hymnal And Liturgies of the Moravian Church:"⁶

Commit thou every grievance
 Into His faithful hands,
 To His sure care and guidance,
 Who heaven and earth commands;
 For He, the clouds' Director,
 Whom winds and seas obey,
 Will be thy kind Protector,
 And will prepare the way.

Rely on God thy Saviour,
 So shalt thou safe go on;
 Build on His grace and favor,
 So shall thy work be done;
 Thou canst make no advances
 By self-consuming care;
 But He His help dispenses,
 When called upon by prayer.

My soul, then, with assurance
 Hope still, be not dismayed;
 He will from each encumbrance
 Again lift up thy head;
 Beyond thy wish extended
 His goodness will appear,
 When He hath fully ended
 What caused they needless fear.

This magnificent hymn is a hymn for our own times. Gerhardt lived through the Thirty Years' War, and it is this fact that gives added significance to the deep, strong beauty of his verses. He is for the time in which we live a splendid example of the inner peace which abides in the soul firmly anchored in the Christ Who said: "Peace I leave with you, my peace I give unto you: not as the world giveth, give I unto you. Let not your heart be troubled, neither let it be afraid" (John 14:27).

The length of many of Gerhardt's hymns, as those of other German hymn writers, has no doubt caused his hymns to be less used in English than otherwise might have been the case. It

ought to be remembered that this feature of German hymnody is due to the practice of dividing a hymn into verses for use throughout a service. The result has been that English books in accommodating these hymns have had to keep in mind the different custom here. This has, however, caused abbreviations and revisions that have weakened the original power and beauty of many of the hymns.

How richly has Gerhardt blessed the church in his beautiful hymns for every season of the Church Year! There is no finer introduction to the Advent season than the hymn, "How shall I meet my Saviour?" In deepest reverence he stands before the manger saying, "Immanuel, to Thee we sing," and is overcome by the unfathomable mystery of the Incarnation of God. On the other hand, the glory of the Christmas Gospel is reflected in the unforgettable hymn, "Froelich soll mein Herze springen," which should be known by everyone, and which Lauxman has called "a glorious series of Christmas thoughts, laid as a garland on the manger at Bethlehem."⁷

All my heart this night rejoices,
 As I hear, far and near,
 Sweetest angel voices:
 Christ is born! their choirs are singing,
 Till the air, everywhere,
 Now with joy is ringing.

He helps us over the threshold of the New Year with the familiar song, "In pray'r your voices raise ye." For the Passion Week he offers the choicest pearl in "O Sacred Head, now wounded," based on the Latin hymn, *Salve caput cruentatum*, of Bernard of Clairvaux. At Easter he rallies the faithful with that gem of Easter hymns, based on Job 19:25-27, "I know that my Redeemer lives, In this my faith is fast." And for Trinity Sunday he offers us the fine hymn, "Was alle Weisheit in der Welt," translated as "Scarce tongue can speak, ne'er human ken."

But the range of Gerhardt's hymns includes more than the great festive days of the Church Year. Hymns of praise and thanksgiving to God for His kindly providence, hymns of comfort and hope in seasons of deep distress so common in the experience of man, hymns of trust and confidence in the never-failing help of the Eternal, all these are included in his sacred songs.

Gerhardt may be classified more exactly as a poet of Con-

solation. It is interesting to note the word "Trost" ("comfort") occurs 51 times; "getrost" ("assured"), 11 times; "troesten" ("to comfort"), 10 times; "Freude" ("joy"), 161 times; "Freudenlicht" ("light of joy"), 33 times; "freuen" and "erfreuen" ("to be happy" and "to make happy"), 22 times; "froh" and "froehlich" ("happy" and "joyful"), and synonymous words, 50 times; "Friede" ("peace"), 33 times. And so it is not surprising that Gerhardt could bring such a large measure of cheer, not only to his parishioners, but to all believers in the providence and love of God.⁸

There is hardly an area in the realm of human life and nature which is not re-echoed in Gerhardt's hymns. He sings of the Christian home in which Jesus is the constant guest. Then he asks for God's blessing upon "all others that are in authority." Finally he lifts his eyes above time and sings of eternity. Death, the alien guest on earth, does not have the final word. He is a harmless enemy. Jesus Christ has robbed death of his power. Now the Christian assurance of hope may triumph! "Der Tod selbst ist mein Leben!"

Thus the song of this highly talented hymnist, who "for spontaneity, simplicity, purity, stands preeminent among the German writers,"⁹ has sent its blessing down through the passing centuries upon multitudes, in the church, in the home, and in secret places of prayer and praise.

¹H. A. L. Jefferson, *Hymns In Christian Worship*. (London: Rockliff, 1950), p. 137.

²Carl Bertheau, "Paulus Gerhardt," *The New Schaff-Herzog Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge* (Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1952), Vol. IV. p. 464.

³Catherine Winkworth, *Christian Singers of Germany* (Philadelphia: J. B. Lipincott & Co.), p. 208.

⁴Armin Haeussler, *The Story of Our Hymns* (St. Louis: Eden Publishing House, 1952), p. 672.

⁵Op. Cit., p. 142.

⁶Published by Authority of the Provincial Synod, Bethlehem, Pa., 1920, No. 682.

⁷Quoted by Robert Guy McCutchan, *Hymns In the Lives of Men* (Nashville: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1945), p. 127.

⁸For the facts in the above paragraph I am indebted to Armin Haeussler, Op. Cit., p. 671.

⁹W. Garrett Horder, *The Hymn Lover* (London: J. Curwen & Sons Ltd., third Edition revised), p. 361.

The Closing Hymn

H. MYRON BRAUN

THE PURPOSE OF this article is to discuss the nature and use of the closing or final hymn in a service of worship in Protestant churches, and the conditions relating to the selection of one hymn from a whole hymnal-full to be a closing hymn for a given service. I have discovered that the writers of books on the subject of Christian worship and church music very rarely deal with the specific subject of the closing hymn, and then in no detail. A study of this sort becomes simply a matter of applying general principles of the uses and values of hymns to a specific situation, and adding something of one's own experience, observations, and rather definite convictions in the area of Christian worship.

I.

The first problem is the obvious problem of whether or not there shall be a closing hymn, or how the service shall be closed. It is generally accepted that there shall be a Benediction, or at least its modern substitute in some non-liturgical churches the "closing prayer." But, other than Benediction, practice varies widely as to what elements are at the end of the service. In Protestantism, where congregational singing has been widely used, one would expect to find the singing of a hymn near the end of the service. And that practice is widespread enough, at least, to make feasible the writing of an article on the subject. Nonetheless, in a number of churches I have known, there is no closing hymn. The sermon comes to an end, the people rise and receive the Benediction, and that is all.

Yet there is a need for the people to give expression to their feelings at the close of a service of worship, to make some kind of response to emotions, ideas, and ideals that may have been aroused within them. This is the very need that was met with the "altar call" of the revival meeting. Those who know something about evangelism tell us that, having thus made our "sales talk," we should not then fail to clinch the sale, that is, to give the worshiper the chance to say "Yes," to give expression to his resolve. This very important function usually devolves upon the closing hymn.

A number of liturgies make possible a larger amount of congregational expression toward the end of the service. In most Lutheran services the Offering—a very tangible means of ex-

pression—plus certain other liturgical material, follows the sermon. A number of Methodist pastors of my acquaintance conduct services regularly where the sermon is followed by the Pastoral Prayer, followed in turn by Offering, Closing Hymn, and Benediction. This makes the sermon an integral part of the service, and ample opportunity for response and expression of dedication and resolve is given at the end of the service.

It is perhaps more customary that the service be really in two parts: the worship, that comes to its moment of dedication in the Offering, followed then by the Sermon, a separate unit. In earlier days in the non-liturgical churches the sermon held the place of pre-eminence, and all else was thought of as "preliminaries," to be done away with as quickly as possible. In this system the closing hymn has great importance on the extent to which the sermon influences the lives of people.

II

One incidental problem to the closing hymn is whether or not it shall be a recessional—with choir moving out of the church during the singing. The Englishman Sir H. Walford Davies (in his *Music in Christian Worship*) says "no" to this—that processionals (and recessionals) should have a particular purpose of leading to a special place of devotion, and not be just a ceremonial to get in and out of church. The Church of England Archbishop's Committee's 1951 report on "Music in Church" takes a similar view. On the contrary, American churchmen, especially in the non-liturgical churches all too devoid of pageantry, have found processionals and recessions an orderly way of moving the choir to its proper place as well as providing the symbolism of a group of worshipers, approaching and departing from the center of worship.

Processionals and recessions become awkward in some of the architectural monstrosities Protestants have called churches, where there is no direct way from choir room to chancel or choir loft.

Then again, if the recessional takes the choir too far away before the end of the hymn, the congregation is left struggling without the leadership it has come too much to depend upon. If we are singing "Jesus shall reign," in the last stanza, with the choir gone, the words "And earth repeat the loud Amen" are a bit muffled.

The recessional poses a problem also in regard to the Benediction. Shall it be before the hymn or after? Obviously, one cannot have a recessional and still retain all the appropriate positions for both clergyman and Benediction—*i.e.*, clergyman following choir in recessional, Benediction last, and Benediction given from altar. The Archbishops' Committee's report, referred to above, has a definite conviction on this also:

A hymn after the Blessing at Mattins or Evensong, whether sung in choir or on the way out, is particularly undesirable, because it takes away from the solemn dismissal, which is the true meaning of the Blessing.

If we are both to have a recessional and to follow this point of view, the Benediction must be given from a part of the church away from the altar or else the clergyman does not walk in the recessional. Both of these alternatives are known to exist in actual usage, as well as the third alternative of having the Benediction before the recessional.

In one smaller church of my acquaintance, the vestry room is in the back of the church and the choir has no way of getting there except through the center aisle. During the final hymn, the choir moves down the aisle, not in the sense of a ceremonial recessional but simply as a functional necessity of getting to the back of the church before the congregation breaks up. They wait at the back of the church, thus adding their voices to the singing of the hymn to its completion, and when the service is finished they go on to the vestry. The clergyman remains in the chancel for the Benediction.

Certain restrictions may be placed upon the selection of a closing hymn if it is to be a recessional. There are those who would demand that the tune be in 4/4 time. I'm not so sure that this is an absolute necessity. A Thanksgiving service might well end with the hymn "Not alone for mighty empire," the tune HYFRYDOL being in 3/4 time. But the words are still thrilling and the tune sturdy and rhythmic. Perhaps it would be equally good Christian symbolism for a processional or recessional to include people with different steps, representing different walks of life, united in a common goal, rather than a group of automata marching in precision-step. Another restriction with the use of the recessional is that the hymn chosen is likely to be more vigorous than it might be otherwise. Though the service might best close with a deeply prayerful spirit, such as that of Kath-

arine Lee Bates' "Dear God our Father, at Thy knee confessing," yet words of that tenderness would hardly seem appropriate for a full-fledged recessional.

Finally, concerning the recessional, we would remember the type of service in question. The recessional perhaps would be used at the Sunday morning service but services at other times may well end differently. So the question as to whether or not the closing hymn be a recessional will depend upon the architecture of the building, the type of service concerned, and also the director's preference as to the meter of tunes sung while walking.

III

Turning then to the actual selection of a closing hymn, we would first remember its purpose. Thus, it might be no more than a simple benediction-prayer, "May the grace of Christ our Savior." Or it may be a hymn of high resolve, "Come, labor on." Or a hymn of intense dedication, "O Jesus, I have promised." Or, especially in these churches thought of as "non-liturgical," it would have some relationship to the sermon. Its words need not necessarily repeat the themes of the sermon — the people have already heard that — but may well extend it, give it application, give it expression in the words of the people.

To illustrate from the services of the church I happen to be best acquainted with at the present time: A sermon on the 250th anniversary of John Wesley's birth was concluded with Charles Wesley's "A charge to keep I have." A sermon on "What is essential about religion" was finished with George Doane's "Thou art the Way: to Thee alone." Or, again, "A Gospel of power," built around the recurring theme of "That at the name of Jesus every knee should bow," was concluded with North's "O Master of the waking world."

Finally, of course, in the selection of a closing hymn, the general principles underlying the quality of all hymns must be taken into account — that they be of high poetical and musical quality.

IV

There is one other area to be mentioned in connection with the closing hymn, and that has to do with specialized uses — when a certain response is to be evoked by the use of the hymn. The largest use in this area is in the "altar call," when the people are expected to come forward from their places, kneel at the altar rail and profess a newly-strengthened belief in Christ. The ser-

mon ends and a hymn, usually of a very sentimental and subjective nature, is announced, such as "Just as I am, without one plea" or "Softly and tenderly Jesus is calling." The singing, plus the earnest and emotional exhortations of the evangelist, have many, many times brought the desired results.

An adaptation of the altar call is one where more nearly all of the people present come forward for a time of private prayer at the altar rail. This is frequently used at evening services when the lights can be lowered and attention centered about some particular object—cross or altar—specially illuminated. Here the hymn that follows the sermon would bring out the idea of personal dedication, perhaps along some particular line, and would provide background for the individual's prayer thoughts as he came to the altar rail. In this experience, the expression of thoughts in song is heightened when the person adds physical movement to his response.

To sum up, the closing hymn is no different from other hymns—it is chosen from the same hymnal, it is chosen according to the same standards of quality, as the others. The detailed mechanics surrounding its use will vary with the design of the church and the thought-patterns of those in charge of worship. But it has a definite purpose to fulfill in concluding the service, and it must be chosen with care to give appropriate expression to the highest and noblest thoughts and resolves that have come to the mind and heart of the worshiper in all that has preceded, that all of life may move closer to the glory of God.

Hymns In Periodical Literature

REVIEWS BY RUTH ELLIS MESSENGER

Joseph J. Reilly, "Cardinal Newman Remonstrates," *Catholic Choirmaster*, Spring, 1953. (Dr. Reilly, the well-known Newman scholar, whose death occurred Jan. 24, 1951, had completed this article which was found among his papers. It was prepared for publication by Dr. Margaret Grennan.)

In the 1873 edition of *The Hymnal Companion*, edited by The Reverend Edward Henry Bickersteth, a fourth stanza was added to Newman's "Lead, kindly light" as follows:

Meantime along the narrow rugged path,
Thyself hath trod,

Lead, Saviour, lead me home in child-like faith
 Home to my God,
 To rest forever, after earthly strife,
 In the calm light of everlasting life. Amen.

When the additional stanza was called to Newman's attention in 1874, he corresponded with the Editor, to learn that Bickersteth himself was the author. His explanation is found in a letter of June 19, 1874.

What led me to add the verse was, that exquisitely beautiful as your lines are, they seemed to me rather to be a poem than a hymn as closing with our reunion with those who have gone before us. In a hymn the heart seems to find its final rest only in God; and I founded the verse on the collect for St. John the Evangelist's day.

An amicable correspondence between Newman and Bickersteth left the former with the impression that this stanza would be deleted in subsequent editions of *The Hymnal Companion*, while the latter understood that it might be continued, with a note as to the authorship. In 1881, after new inquiries made by persons desiring to publish "Lead, kindly light" had brought the matter to a crisis, Newman definitely repudiated the Bickersteth fourth stanza. On March 25 he wrote to an unknown correspondent:

I gladly give you permission to use my hymn "Lead etc." (Three stanzas) . . . but I regret to say that I cannot comply with your request, if you add any verse to it, or alter it. No one likes interpolations in what he has written.

Again, on August 24 he wrote to another inquirer:

In answer to your question, I can but say that it consists of three not four stanzas, and the fourth (to use your words) is not "authentic" but "an unwarranted addendum by another pen."

Finally, in a letter dated Sept. 3, 1890, Bishop Bickersteth reassures Cardinal Newman, of whose death a few days earlier he was apparently unaware, in these words:

The third revised and enlarged edition of my Hymnal will be issued very shortly. The hymn "Lead, Kindly Light" appears very early in the book among those for Evening Prayer, *verbatim* as it was written, without

abridgement or addition. And my verse, which has been for twenty years appended to it in my Hymnal, is now banished to the end of the volume among the doxologies, refrains and sequels.

At the present time no one can tell how widely the interpolated stanza was circulated during the period in question. Dr. Reilly's research has provided valuable information for the hymnologist, as well as a most revealing illustration of the unethical and ruthless treatment accorded to original hymn texts by well-intentioned but self-appointed critics.

W. F. Lofthouse, "What makes a Good Hymn?" *Congregational Quarterly* (London), Oct., 1953.

The originality of this article upon a subject so frequently discussed, lies in the author's conviction that one's judgment upon a hymn cannot be an individual judgment. "Are we imprisoned," he asks "within our own preferences?"

Communal praise and worship has no room for personal likes and aversions. Both the tune and the words of a hymn must be such as are easily learned and remembered; and they should be moving, yet containing nothing in which the normal congregation would not wish to join. The greatest essential is perhaps catholicity with its appeal to the general rather than the specific in man's nature.

Granted that a hymn possesses every excellence that may be humanly contrived, Mr. Lofthouse reminds us that the inspiration of our song is a divine gift which is in turn offered for divine approval. "At the heart of every hymn — words and tune — which deserves to be called 'good' or to be allowed to live lies the combination of qualities, simplicity, order, harmony of intent and action, with the added element of reverence, which is conscious of God, moves to God, and is gathered into God."

Agnes Sligh Turnbull, "There's Healing in Hymns," *Christian Herald*, Nov., 1953.

Well-known as the author of *The Bishop's Mantle*, *The Gown of Glory* and many other publications, Agnes Sligh Turnbull here asserts for the modern generation the healing efficacy of hymns which were so reassuring to the Christian worshipers of a generation or two ago. Reminding us of the hymn singing in the "Mid-week Prayer Meeting" and in the home, when the tempo of life and experience was relatively slower than ours, she finds the same outreach for rest, peace, atonement, forgive-

ness and divine grace, present then and now. But, in the former way of life, hymns brought their healing message whereas the same relief is sought today in psychological therapy.

Mrs. Turnbull pleads for a return to the hymn and hymn singing as the answer to the modern need. She cites hymn after hymn, of varied periods and authorship, several of them the finest in our present-day hymnals, witnessing to their significance in her own experience and that of others. The author is not a preacher but her article has a convincing Christian message for every reader.

Irving Lowens and Allen P. Britton, "The Easy Instructor (1798-1831): A History and Bibliography of the First Shape Note Tune Book," *Journal of Research in Music Education*, Spring, 1953.

The general topic of early sacred music in America has been the subject of considerable research in recent years, publicized by such well-known writers as A. M. Buchanan, G. P. Jackson, John Powell, A. C. Lovelace and others including the authors of the article now before us. This work has been marked by two general trends, a) an examination into the methods of music instruction and b) the recovery and harmonization of melodies otherwise obsolete. In connection with both objectives, bibliographical study has been fundamental.

This article offers a complete account of the origin of *The Easy Instructor*, its editors, collaborators, printers and publishers throughout the thirty years of its publication; and what is equally important, the changing character of its contents, to meet changing musical taste. In this phase, the article becomes a valuable index to the progress of musical culture in contemporaneous America. Eight tables and several illustrations are most acceptable graphic aids to an understanding of the material by the lay reader.

Allen P. Britton and Irving Lowens, "Unlocated Titles in Early Sacred American Music," *Music Library Association Notes*, XI, I, Dec. 1953.

Here, Dr. Britton and Dr. Lowens describe their efforts to establish a comprehensive bibliography of American tune books. Such books constituted the first music text books used in this country and are of major importance in the study of musical training and practice.

Unfortunately, these books are rare today, due for the most part to the hard usage they received. However, a large majority

of the titles in question have been located. A number of unlocated titles remain about which descriptive items are extant, although sometimes inadequate. The authors have appended a list of 81 titles, inviting cooperation toward locating specimens of the actual publications. Although lack of space forbids the Editors of THE HYMN to publish the full list as appended (a few copies of which are available and may be had from Allen P. Britton, School of Music, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan), an abbreviated list of authors and titles appears below. Any librarian, book collector, antiquarian bookman, or reader who may be able to locate any of them, is invited to correspond with Dr. Britton.

Aitken, J., *A Collection of Sacred Music*, Phila., c1807. *The American Harmony*. Phila., 1793.

Asplund, J., *New Collection*. Baltimore, 1793.

Atwill, T. H., *The New York Collection*. Lansingsburgh, 1795.

Badger, J., *A Collection of the best Psalm and Hymn tunes*. Charleston, 1752.

Bayley, D., *Select Harmony*. Newburyport, 1784.

Belcher, S., *Mr. Belcher's celebrated Ordination Anthem*. Boston, 1797.

Billings, N., *The Republican Harmony*. Troy, 1795.

Billings, W., *An Anthem . . . and A Hymn*. Boston, 1787; also, *An Anthem for Thanksgiving*. Boston, 1793; also, *Easter Anthem*. Boston, no date.

Brady and Tate, *A New Version etc.* Boston 1713.

A Brief Discourse concerning Regular Singing. Boston, 1725.

Bull, A., *The New Universal Psalmody*. New Haven, 1767.

Cole, J., *The Beauties of Divine Harmony*. Baltimore, 1800; also, *Cecilian Harmony*. Baltimore, 1800; also *The Divine Harmonist*. Baltimore, 1802; also *Evangelical Harmony*. 18-; also, *Primitive Psalmody*. Baltimore, 1836; also, *Sacred Harmony*. Baltimore, 1799; also, *Sacred Harmony*. Pt. II. Baltimore, 1799.

A Collection of Anthems and Hymn Tunes. Newburyport, 1784.

A Collection of Church Music. No. 1 Phila., 1786.

A Collection of Favorite Anthems. Newburyport, 1772.

A Collection of Psalm-Tunes in Three Parts. Boston, 1723.

A Collection of 26 Psalm Tunes. Boston, 1722.

A Cudgel to Drive the Devil Out. Phila., 1763.

Dawson, W., *The Youth's Entertaining Amusement*. Phila., 1754.

Dearborn, B., *The Vocal Instructor*. Boston, 1797.

Edson, L., Jr., *The Social Harmonist*. N. Y., 1800.

The Federal Harmony. Boston, 1785.

The Gamut or Scale of Music. Hartford, 1788.

Holden, O., *New Collection of Sacred Music*. Announced, Boston, 1793.

Holyoke, S., *Harmonia Sacra*. Vol. I. Announced, Boston, 1807.

(To be continued)

Reviews

Leonard Ellinwood, *The History of American Church Music*, Morehouse Gorham Company, New York, N. Y., 1953. \$6.00.

Dr. Ellinwood ranks as one of our most distinguished American scholars and hymnologists. His work of research and editing in connection with the *Hymnal 1940 Companion* brought much deserved acclamation. His new book comes at a time when there is great interest in and need for clarification of a number of points in the history of American Church Music.

There are many areas of research open to the musicologist and scholar in the field of American Church Music. Dr. Ellinwood has given us a broad perspective from which to view this entire subject, while avoiding tedious recital of scholarly evidence, preferring to use illustrative material directly from various American churches.

The first part of the book treats of the early musical life in New Spain, metrical psalmody in the colonies, singing schools and early choirs, fuguing tunes (and the work of Billings), eighteenth century composers, and early organs and bells.

On page 52, Dr. Ellinwood writes: "In America the best efforts in the field of sacred composition came from the various Moravian settlements. Unfortunately, little of their music is generally known today." Perhaps with the publication of the Early American Moravian Anthems, under Clarence Dickinson's editorship, this area of neglect will no longer exist.

Part II of this history deals with American church music from 1820 to 1920. Dr. Ellinwood's description of

and analysis of quartet choirs is extremely well done and is the first description of this phenomenon to this reviewer's knowledge that does justice to the subject. On one point there is room for disagreement. On page 75 Dr. Ellinwood states: "It remained for the liturgical movement of recent decades to demonstrate in a convincing manner how little of true worship there could be in the singing of a quartet." This is certainly a factor, but one suspects that the growth of the "multiple choir" system—dating in some communities back to the very earliest years of this century—was a factor of great consequence in the non-liturgical churches. That the rise and growth of the liturgical revival influenced church music in this country is undoubtedly, and would provide material for a separate volume.

Part III carries forward the historical development, discussing the evolution of a more suitable choral and organ repertory, the twentieth century phenomena of church conferences, commissions, and choir schools. There is a section devoted to outstanding church musicians of this century, as well as a fine essay on the hymnal as a merger of many traditions. In connection with the essays in this section, there is one entitled "Matters Liturgical." It is interesting to note that the Benson-edited Presbyterian hymnal of the last century had the congregational responses for communion, though it is doubtful that many churches made use of the musical settings provided.

Some interesting data are provided in the Appendices, though the list of organists in Trinity Parish, New York, hardly seems necessary in a history of American Church Music.

There is no mention in this volume of the work of H. Augustine Smith, whose influence during the early part of the 1920's was immense. He lighted the fires of dissatisfaction with the old-fashioned ways of doing things and certainly stirred up interest in hymnology, sacred art, and graded choirs.

A more recent influence on American church music has been the outstanding work in the music departments of our colleges and universities. Young people have become acquainted with great choral masterpieces and have been dissatisfied with inferior church musical endeavors. The accomplishments of such schools as the University of Redlands deserve study and analysis.

A number of inter-denominational camps and summer musical conferences have been successful and might be mentioned. The work of such leaders as Ruth K. Jacobs would seem to deserve mention, along with the contributions of such pioneers as Paul Swarm and Donald Kettring.

Perhaps the most unusual omission was any mention of the work of The Hymn Society of America. Though small in numbers over the years, there has been a definite contribution in terms of improvement in standards of hymnody and the acquainting of segments of the church-going population with historical backgrounds of hymnody.

It is hoped that a future edition of this monumental work may incorporate further details not discussed in the present volume, as well as the excellent material here presented. This book is a *must* for anyone desiring an acquaintance with this entire field of inquiry.

—George Litch Knight

Robert M. Stevenson, *Patterns of Protestant Church Music*, Duke University Press, Durham, N. C., 1953. \$4.00.

The title and preface of the book led this reviewer to expect that ongoing influences would be defined and discussed. This series of twelve essays with two supplementary ones is fascinating reading and will hold one's attention consistently; however, when the reading is finished, we ask ourselves if the collection would not be more aptly called "Conspicuous Personalities in Various Traditions of Protestant Church Music" or some similar and less awkward title. The author's expressed intention "to trace the differing musical traditions that have grown up in the various denominations" has hardly been accomplished. Instead, he has introduced us to some of the most prominent figures in Protestant music, poets and composers, whose works have profoundly affected the musical traditions of Protestantism. If one accepts the book as an examination of the individual contributions of certain outstanding musicians and poets, the reader will find much information and stimulation in its pages.

Scant reference is made to the influence of these men beyond their own lifetimes; and so, one closes the book with such questions as these still unanswered: What happened to the Lutheran chorale after Bach's time and why do we find today such banal harmonizations in many hymnals of the Lutheran tradition? Where are the influences described in these essays found to be most effectively at work today? For example, what branch of Lutheranism has best preserved the pure Lutheran tradition and why?

Since nineteenth century hymn composers are more fully represented than any other single group in contemporary hymnal indices, why is the discussion of this period limited to Samuel Sebastian Wesley and Ira Sankey? Most congregations are more familiar with the tunes of Barnby, Dykes, Mason, Smart, Stainer and Sullivan.

The opening chapter, "Luther's Musical Achievement," is a brief and penetrating appreciation of this great man's policy and practice in church music. It should be required reading for all pastors, church boards, organists and choirmasters. Some disappointment came with reading Chapter II, "Reformed Church Music: The Basic Implications of Calvin's Philosophy of Church Music." John Calvin's actual influence on church music seems to have been an inhibiting and restrictive one. It would, therefore, seem more appropriate to treat Reformed Church Music from a more positive point of view, showing how Calvinist poets and musicians succeeded in making a beautiful and significant contribution to Protestant Church Music in spite of Calvin. Seeing the practice of Reformed Church music through Calvin's eyes is like looking at a photographic negative. The positive print may show the same details but with what differences in light and shadow! The hymnal of the Reformed Church of France and its use today in public worship is ample evidence that John Calvin did not succeed in enforcing his views on the music of his own church.

The chapter on Merbecke is engrossing. Here are seventy footnotes in seventeen pages of text, but, since other great contemporary church musicians are mentioned such as Tye and

Taverner, why are Thomas Tallis and William Byrd not included in a description of these turbulent years in British church music? The only mention of Tallis and Byrd is made in connection with the essays on the Wesleys when the closing paragraph begins "In our time, when the works of such men as Byrd and Tallis, are still insufficiently known." . . . Both men made an outstanding contribution to Protestant Church Music.

The Bach chapters are well written and perceptive. Taking issue with Schweitzer, Stevenson writes: "Bach found only in Lutheran high orthodoxy a congenial environment in which to produce two passions, the Magnificat and the so-called 'oratorios'." The author feels that Bach's religious convictions were congenial to the prevailing theological conservatism, and, that at Leipzig he enjoyed a position as secure and remunerative as any church musician of his time could expect to have. The theories of Bach's resistance to rigid orthodoxy or his lack of financial support are convincingly refuted by references to historical sources. The chapter on Bach's "appeals to Caesar" and its application to the present day — when secular musical circles respect and reverence his work more than church congregations and choirs for which bodies he composed — is apt and fresh. And the conclusion ". . . whatever worldly success he may have achieved by his appeals to Caesar, his essential message is still germane only in a Christian society and is still valid only in a Christian context." — is a challenge to all church musicians and congregations today. Bach's quarrel with his superior, Ernesti, brings to light some of the frustrations and

Mason Neale attempts to bring to light some obscure pages in his life history. Mention is made of rebukes from ecclesiastical superiors but the real issue is left in doubt. What did "his spirit of independence as to his beliefs and religious exercises" involve?

The case for "gospel" hymns as a means to an end, "lengthy convert lists as a measure of efficacy in sacred music," is as clear and fair to this musical tradition as any this reviewer has read. "In an age when religion must win mass approval in order to survive, in an age when religion must at least win a majority vote from the electorate, gospel hymnody is inevitable." All editors of hymnals who expect wide distribution for their works must come to grips with this fact. For many it will not be easy to make concessions to popular taste, but, if hymnals are to be used, they must be useful. This last chapter raises a question which came to mind from time to time throughout the book. It would have been interesting to know the author's opinion of the state of church music in the state-supported churches as compared with the "free" churches. There is some evidence in these pages that Protestant and Catholic musical standards have been maintained and strengthened by state-supported churches whereas standards were more difficult to maintain when the taste of the masses had to be considered.

Each chapter contains an impressive number of references to a large bibliography. This list of one hundred and seventy volumes on church music is a splendid source of authoritative works.

disturbing conditions under which the great composer worked. Thirty-eight pages — more than those given any other personality — have been devoted to a church musician whom the author feels has failed as yet to find his place in Protestant church music. Perhaps these chapters constitute an appeal to pastors and choirmasters to give Bach a more prominent place in church worship today. I would not take exception to any of this discussion of Bach, but I do feel that much of the material belongs to a study on Bach rather than to the design of this collection of essays.

Handel's treatment is puzzling. The author's conclusion seems to be that only the *Messiah* of all Handel's compositions has enjoyed an enduring place in Protestant church music. Handel appears to have failed to make the contribution he might have made had his oratorio texts been less "dated" and more universal in appeal. The detailed information about Handel's librettos is interesting but hardly relevant to the Protestant musical tradition since the pattern of most of them has been outmoded and discarded.

Watts is discussed with particular reference to those theological concepts and expressions which later generations have found unacceptable. A new point of view on Wesley establishes evidence for a gradual spiritual growth in his life rather than the cataclysmic change usually attributed to the Aldersgate experience. Proof for this theory is drawn from Wesley's lifetime interest in hymnology and the recurring pattern of hymn selections in all hymnals he edited beginning with 1737 (before Aldersgate). The other members of the Wesley family also receive careful treatment. The chapter on John

Two appendices on the present state of Catholic and Jewish music in the United States are provocative and offer well-justified criticism of current inertia in both traditions. The author gives scrupulous documentation for his assertions and is a convincing writer. This makes one wonder why other quotations in the book are not also noted, for example, a quotation from Acts 23:6 on page 59, from Genesis 16:11 on page 66 and from Milton's sonnet "Oh His Blindness" on page 40.

On closing this book, one feels that it contains a summary of the accomplishments and failures of the outstanding men in the field of Protestant church music. "It has been written for church musicians . . . It has been written also for pastors and other religious leaders . . ." These groups as well as all who are concerned with church music will find the book an important addition to their libraries. It will also serve to cause all readers to re-examine their own prejudices and to evaluate the practices of our time in church music. The author should one day address himself to the task of tracing patterns of development from Luther's time to the present. He seems well qualified for this undertaking and could produce a very useful work on this subject.

— Clementine Miller Tangeman

HAROLD BECKET GIBBS, a distinguished member of The Hymn Society of America, was the recipient of the Liturgical Music Award for 1954, a medal presented by The Society of St. Gregory of America for leadership in the Gregorian reform movement in America. The ceremony took place,

March 10, at St. Charles Seminary, Overbrook, Pa. The Reverend John C. Selner, S. S. made the formal announcement of the Award. Dr. Gibbs acknowledged the award as follows: "It is with deep gratitude and sincere happiness that I accept the honor you have seen fit to bestow upon me, and I should indeed be a strange specimen of humanity if, down deep in my heart, I did not feel moved . . . My own life in this field was begun at Solesmes in 1893 when, with the founder of the Plainsong and Medieval Music Society of London — Harry Bainbridge Briggs — I knocked at the Gregorian citadel where Dom André Mocquereau was Prior. There, under the tutelage of Dom Mocquereau did I assimilate my first practical lessons in Gregorian Chant. My early love for the church's own music grew rapidly, and I know that the blessing I received in 1914 when kneeling at the feet of our beloved Pius X has today culminated, in the year of his canonization, in my receiving this Gregorian Medal which I so deeply prize."

AMONG OUR CONTRIBUTORS

THE REVEREND H. MYRON BRAUN, candidate for the degree of M.S.M. at Union Theological Seminary, is Pastor of The Browne Memorial Methodist Church, Jersey City, N. J.

THE REVEREND ARTHUR S. HOLBROOK is Superintendent Minister of the Peak and Bradwell Circuit, Sheffield, England. He spoke on "The Sheffield Associations of Montgomery" at a Hymn Festival held in Victoria Hall, Sheffield, one of the features of the recent Conference of The Hymn Society of Great Britain and Ireland which met at Sheffield, Eng-

land. The Editors are grateful to Mr. Holbrook for his companion article on "Montgomery's American Associations," which binds us closely to the theme and spirit of the British Commemoration.

THE REVEREND JOHN H. JOHANSEN, S.T.M., is Pastor of Christ Moravian Church, Winston - Salem, North Carolina; Instructor, Salem College, Winston-Salem, and a student of Moravian hymn writers and others in the early German tradition. We would remind our readers of his article, "James Montgomery and his Contribution to English Hymnody," *Religion In Life*, Summer, 1951, an interesting and scholarly but all-too-brief treatment of the subject of our current anniversary.

J. WILLIAM JONES, Choirmaster and leader in the School of Music, University of Redlands, California, is well-known throughout the country. Hymn lovers will welcome the new collection of hymn recordings, and look forward to the future development of this and similar projects. The University of Redlands Choir may be heard on Columbia Masterworks Records, "Hymns and Anthems," ML 4866, released May 1, 1954.

THE MONTGOMERY CENTENARY

During 1954 it is especially appropriate to have festivals celebrating the contribution of James Montgomery to English Hymnody. This year marks the one hundredth anniversary of his death, and provides an opportunity to honor a great hymn writer.

One such Festival has already been

held in New York City, on Sunday, May 2, in St. Michael's Protestant Episcopal Church. Copies of the Bulletin for that Festival may be obtained from The Hymn Society for suggestions useful in building a service of that type.

James Montgomery's hymns are to be found in all major denominational books, as well as other collections. He was a prolific hymn writer, with about ten or twelve of his four hundred hymns remaining in common use.

Montgomery was nominally a Moravian throughout his life. The Moravian connection provides an opportunity to use music from that tradition, both continental and in this country. The H. W. Gray Company of New York City has recently published a series of Early American Moravian Anthems, edited by Dr. Clarence Dickinson. A number of these are hymnic in character, and are within the reach of the average church choir. This series helps to fill in a wide gap in our American traditional and folk song background.

THE JULIAN REVISION COMMITTEE would like to secure the following hymnals, now out of print, for the Editor, Mr. Bunn: *The Oxford American Hymnal*, Oxford Univ. Press, 1930; *Immanuel Hymnal*, MacMillan, 1929; *Psalter Hymnal*, United Presbyterian Bd. of Pub., Pittsburgh, 1927. Any reader who is willing to send the committee a copy, please communicate with the Editor of THE HYMN.